

BEFORE THE  
NATIONAL COAL COUNCIL  
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY  
FEDERAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING  
TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

11 April 2018  
Washington, D.C. USA

---

BUNN & ASSOCIATES  
Registered Professional Reporters Worldwide  
Post Office Box 297  
310 South Main Street  
Lusk, Wyoming 82225 USA  
In USA 1-800-435-2468 Worldwide 001-307-334-2423  
Worldwide Telefax 001-307-316-0388  
E-mail: BUNNORLDWIDE@aol.com  
Copyright 2018 All rights reserved.

## 1 COUNCIL MEMBERS:

2	GREGORY A. WORKMAN	Chair National Coal Council Director Fuels Dominion Energy, Inc.
3		
4		
5	ROBERT O. AGBEDE	Vice Chair Hatch Chester
6		
7	C. THOMAS ALLEY, Jr.	Vice President Generation Sector Electric Power Research Institute (EPRI)
8		
9		
10	BARBARA FARMER-ALTIZER	Executive Director Virginia Coal & Energy Alliance, Inc.
11		
12	DONNA D. ANDERSON	Vice President and CFO Babcock Power Services, Inc.
13		
14	RODNEY ANDREWS	Director Center for Applied Energy Research "CAER"
15		
16	SHANNON ANGIELSKI	Principal Governmental Issues Van Ness Feldman LLP Carbon Utilization Research Council
17		
18		
19	Hon. DUANE ANKNEY	Senator Senator of Montana
20	RANDALL ATKINS	Executive Chair and Director Ramaco Coal, LLC
21		
22		

23

Continued.....

## 1 COUNCIL MEMBERS (Continued):

2	RICHARD BAJURA	Director
3		National Research Center
4		for Coal & Energy
		West Virginia University
5	SHANNON MAHHER BANAGA	Director, Federal Affairs
		TECO Energy
6	ROBERT A. BIBB	Chair
7		Bibb Engineers, Architects
		& Constructors
8	JASON BOHRER	President & CEO
9		Lignite Energy Council
10	RICK BOYD	Director of Generation
		Projects
11		Dominion Energy
12	LISA J. N. BRADLEY	Principal Toxicologist
		Haley & Aldrich
13	BRENDA BRICKHOUSE	Vice President of
14		Environment & Energy
15		Policy
16		Chief Sustainability
		Officer
		Tennessee Valley Authority
17	JAMES "JIMMY" BROCK	CEO
		CNX Coal Resources, LP
18	ALFRED "BUD" BROWN	CEO
19		ION Engineering
20	ROXANNE BROWN	Assistant Legislative
		Director
21		United Steelworkers
22	F. WILLIAM BROWNELL	Hunton & Williams
23	CHARLES W. BULLINGER	Senior Principal Engineer
		Green River Energy

## 1 COUNCIL MEMBERS (Continued):

2 JOHN CASSADY Vice President Legislative  
3 Affairs  
4 National Rural Electric  
5 Cooperative Association

6 HENRY J. CIALONE President & CEO  
7 EWI (Edison Welding  
8 Institute)

9 KIPP CODDINGTON Director, Energy Policy &  
10 Economics  
11 Carbon Management  
12 Institute School of Energy  
13 Resources  
14 University of Wyoming

15 BRAD CRABTREE Vice President Fossil  
16 Energy  
17 Great Plains Institute

18 JOSEPH W. CRAFT III President  
19 Alliance Coal

20 DIANA ALEJANDRA DAURY Boilers Clean Combustion  
21 Leader  
22 GE Power

23 DAVID L. DENTON Senior Fellow  
Susteon, Inc.

KATHERINE DOMBROWSKI Manager Technology  
Development  
AECOM

JOHN DUDDY Director Heavy Oil & Coal  
Technology  
Axens North America, Inc.

GEORGE DUGGAN Vice President  
Coal Marketing  
BNSF Railway

23

## 1 COUNCIL MEMBERS (Continued):

2	MICHAEL D. DURHAM	Founder Soap Creek Energy
3		
4	RON ELLER	CEO Tinum
5		
6	RUSS EPTING	Vice President Coal Sales & Marketing CSX Transportation
7		
8	JEFF ERIKSON	General Manager Global CCS Institute
9		
10	DAVID M. FLANNERY	Member Steptoe & Johnson, PLLC
11		
12	MARK FORWERCK	Managing Director North America LP AMINA LLC
13		
14	DAVID A. FREDERICK	Director, Fuel FirstEnergy Solutions Corporation
15		
16	THOMAS K. GALE	Director of Technology Development Novinda Corporation
17		
18	DANNY L. GRAY	Executive Vice President Government and Environmental Affairs Charah, LLC
19		
20	MATTHEW GREEK	Senior Vice President Engineering & Construction Basin Electric Power Cooperative
21		
22	ROBERT R. HARDMAN	Vice President Fuel supply Dynergy, Inc.

23

Continued.....

## 1 COUNCIL MEMBERS (Continued):

2	JOHN HARJU	Vice President for Strategic Partnerships
3		University of North Dakota
4		Energy & Environmental Research Center
5	ROY W. HILL	Chair & President
6		Clean Energy Technology Association, Inc.
7	WILLIAM HOBACK	Energy Project Consultant
8		Southern Illinois University
9		Advanced Coal & Energy Research Center
10	MICHAEL J. HOLMES	Vice President
11		Research & Development Lignite Energy Council
12	SUSAN W. JACKSON	Manager
13		CCP & Waste Management Santee Cooper
14	DENNIS R. JAMES	Director, New Technology
15		North American Coal Corporation
16	KIM L. JOHNSON	Managing Partner
17		Gen2, LLC
18	BRIAN KALK	Director of Energy Systems Development
19		Energy & Environmental Research Center
20	CASEY J. KAPTUR	Principal
21		RungePincockMinarco
22	MICHAEL KARMIS	Virginia Tech
23		Mining & Mineral Engineering

## 1 COUNCIL MEMBERS (Continued):

2	STEVEN KRIMSKY	Vice President Operations Jupiter Oxygen Corp.
3		
4	HOLLY KRUTKA	Vice President Coal Generation & Emissions Technologies Peabody
5		
6	ROXANN LAIRD	Director National Carbon Capture Center Southern Company
7		
8		
9	DAVID LAWSON	VP Coal Marketing Norfolk Southern Corporation
10		
11	MARK LEWIS	Elected Director Central Arizona Project
12	JOHN LONG	COO Connemara Ltd.
13		
14	LEONARD J. MARSICO	Partner McGuire Woods
15	CHARLES D. McCONNELL	Executive Director Rice University Energy and Environment Initiative
16		
17	CHARLES S. McNEIL	CEO NexGen Resources Corporation
18		
19	EMILY S. MEDINE	Principal Energy Trading Company
20		
21	TOM METCALFE	Senior Vice President Power Generation WEC Energy Group WE Energies
22		

23

Continued.....

## 1 COUNCIL MEMBERS (Continued):

2	RAFIC Y. MINKARA	Vice President Research & Development Boral Resources, LLC
3		
4	BETSY B. MONSEAU	CEO American Coal Council
5		
6	MICHAEL E. MOORE	Managing Partner East-West Strategic Advisors
7		
8	CLARK A. MOSELEY	CEO Navajo Transitional Energy Company
9		
10	MICHAEL NASI	Equity Partner Jackson Walker, LLP
11	KENNETH J. NEMETH	Executive Director Southern States Energy Board
12		
13	KAREN OBENSHAIN	Senior Director Fuels, Technology & Commercial Policy Edison Electric Institute
14		
15		
16	MARY EILEEN O'KEEFE	Vice President Business Development Athena Global Energy Solutions
17		
18	FREDRICK D. PALMER	Senior Fellow The Heartland Institute
19		
20	CARYL PFEIFFER	Director, Corporate Fuels & By-Products LG&E & KU Energy LLC
21		
22	ROBERT M. PURGERT	President Energy Industries of Ohio

23

Continued.....

## 1 COUNCIL MEMBERS (Continued):

2 ANGILA M. RETHERFORD Vice President  
3 Environmental Affairs &  
4 Corporate Sustainability  
Vectren Corporation

5 CHARLENE RUSSELL Senior Director  
6 Commercial Development  
Occidental Petroleum  
Corporation

7 PETER SALDITT President  
8 Underground Segment  
Komatsu Mining Corp.

9 TODD SAVAGE Executive Vice President  
10 Group Leader  
Savage Services

11 JOHN SCHULTES CEO & Founder  
12 New Steel International,  
Inc.

13 CONSTANCE L. SENIOR Vice President  
14 Technology  
ADA-ES, Inc.

15 SHARON SJOSTROM Chief Project Officer  
16 Advanced Emissions  
Solutions, Inc.

17 CAROLYN SLAUGHTER Director  
18 Environmental Policy  
American Public Power  
Association

19 DECK S. SLONE Senior Vice President  
20 Strategy & public Policy  
21 Arch Coal

22

23

Continued.....

## 1 COUNCIL MEMBERS (Continued):

2	MICHAEL G. SORENSEN	Senior Manager
3		Fuel & Water Resources
4		Tri-State Generation & Transmission Association, Inc.
5	BENJAMIN SPORTON	Chief Executive
6		World Coal Association
7	G. SCOTT STALLARD	Vice President
8		Director of ASSET360 Platform Atonix Digital
9	VICKY SULLIVAN	Director
10		Environmental & Energy Policy Duke Energy
11	SCOTT TEEL	Vice President
12		Fuel Services Southern Company Operations
13	JOHN W. THOMPSON	Director
14		Fossil Transition Project Clean Air Task Force
15	MATTHEW T. USHER	Director
16		New Gen Engineering American Electric Power/ AEP Generation
17	KATHY WALKER	President
18		Elm Street Resources, Inc.
19	KEMAL WILLIAMSON	President
20		Americas Peabody
21	XIAOLIANG YANG	CCS Team Global Lead
22		World Resources Institute (China)
23		



## 1 ATTENDEES (Continued):

2	DANIEL CARDENAS	CEO
3		National Tribal Energy Association
4	LELAND COGLIANI	Senior Consultant
5		Lewis Burke Associates
6	DONALD COLLINS	CEO
7		Western Research Institute
8	DAN CONNELL	Director, Market Strategy & Business Development
9		CONSOL Energy, Inc.
10	JARAD DANIELS	Director, Strategic Planning & Global Engagement
11		Office of Clean Coal & Carbon Management
12		U.S. Department of Energy
13	CYRIL DRAFFIN	Energy Initiative Project Advisor
14		Massachusetts Institute of Technology
15	MICHAEL ECKARD	Director, Federal Affairs
16		FirstEnergy
17	RANDY EMINGER	Executive Director
18		Energy Policy Network
19	JEFFREY EPPINK	President & Founder
20		Enegis, LLC
21	JOE EVERS	Corporate Counsel & Manager of External Relations
22		Westmoreland Coal Company
23	MAOHONG FAN	Professor
		University of Wyoming

## 1 ATTENDEES (Continued):

2 JOHN FISCHER

Managing Director  
Engineer Procure  
Construct, LLC

3

4 RANDY GENTRY

Deputy Director  
Chief Research Officer  
U.S. department of Energy  
NETL

5

6

7 SHEILA GLESMANN

Managing Consultant  
Emission Strategies, Inc.

8

9 DIETRICH GROSS

Vice CEO  
Jupiter Oxygen Corp.

10

11 JEREMY HARRELL

Managing Director, Policy  
ClearPath Foundation

12

13 CLARK HARRISON

Principal  
Development and Diligence  
LLC

14

15 RICHARD HOGGAN

President  
Millcreek Engineering Co.

16

17 MARTY IRWIN

Environmental Specialist  
Indiana Department of  
Environmental Management

18

19

20 DANIEL JACK

President & Principal  
CDT Insurance Group, LLC

21

22 MICHAEL JONES

Consultant  
Lignite Energy Council

23

ALISON KERESTER

Executive Director  
Global Syngas Technologies  
Council

24

25

26

27

Continued.....

## 1 ATTENDEES (Continued):

2 ANGELOS KOKKINOS Director, Advanced Fossil  
3 Energy Technology Systems  
4 Office of Clean Coal &  
Carbon Management  
U.S. Department of Energy

5 ANTHONY KU Director  
6 Advanced Technologies  
7 National Institute of  
Clean & Low Carbon Energy  
(NICE)

8 JOSHUA LEARN Coal Reporter  
9 S&P Global

10 STEPHEN LEE Reporter  
Bloomberg Environment

11 RUYU LI Administrator  
12 PowerChina America  
Development Ltd.

13 HEATH LOVELL VP - Public Affairs  
14 Alliance Coal, LLC

15 DOUGLAS MATHENEY Special Advisor to the  
16 Secretary  
Fossil Energy  
U.S. Department of Energy

17 MICHAEL McKENNA President  
18 MRW Strategies

19 GREGORY MERLE President  
Riverview Energy

20 NANCY MOHN Consultant

21 ROD OSBORNE Manager, Energy Group  
22 Battelle Memorial  
Institute

23 Continued.....

1	ATTENDEES (Continued):	
2	SEAN PLASYNSKI	Acting Director
3		U.S. Department of Energy NETL
4	MASSOOD RAMEZAN	Senior Technical Advisor
5		KeyLogic Systems
6	RACHEL ROGIER	Federal Affairs
7		Representative
8	DANIEL ROLING	Arch Coal
9		President & CEO
10	FADI SHADID	Novadx Ventures Corp.
11		Industry Economist
12	GEORGE SKOPTSOV	Energy Information
13		Administration
14	MICHELLE SNEED	U.S. Department of Energy
15		President
16	CHUNSHAN SONG	H Quest Vanguard, Inc.
17		Director
18	CONRAD STEWART	Office of Secretarial
19		Boards & Councils
20	JUDD SWIFT	U.S. Department of Energy
21		Distinguished Professor of
22	TOMAS TARKA	Fuel Science &
23		Professor of Engineering
		EMS Energy Institute at
		Penn State University
		National Tribal Energy
		Association
		CEO
		Synfuels Americas
		Senior Engineer
		U.S. Department of Energy
		NETL

1     ATTENDEES (Continued):

2     AUDREY TAUCHER                    Taucher International

3     OSAMU USUI                         Deputy General Manager  
4   Mitsubishi Heavy  
  Industries America

5     ROXANN WALSH                      Director  
6   CCS & Renewable/DG R&D  
  Southern Company

7     KARL WEISS                         Vice President MH&U  
8   Caterpillar

9     KAZUKO WHITE                      Assistant General Manager  
  Mitsubishi Corp. Americas

10    EDDIE JOE WILLIAMS                Federal Representative  
11   Southern States Energy  
  Board  
  Office of the President

12   Director  
13    TOMASZ WILTOWSKI                   Advanced Coal & Energy  
  Research Center  
14   Southern Illinois  
  University

15   Business Development  
16    SAM WOODS                           Manager  
  Navajo Transitional Energy  
17   Co.

18    HAO YU                             Student  
19   George Washington  
  University

20

21

22

23

	I N D E X	Page
1		
2		
3	INTRODUCTIONS By Assistant Secretary Winberg	19
4	KEYNOTE PRESENTATION By Thomas J. Pyle	27
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23

BEFORE THE  
NATIONAL COAL COUNCIL  
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY  
FEDERAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING  
Meeting was held pursuant to Invitation  
at the New Hampshire Conference Room, the Wink  
Hotel, 1143 New Hampshire Avenue, NW, D.C., USA,  
commencing on the 11th day of April, 2018, at 7:00  
p.m. ET.

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

MS. GELLICI: Ladies and Gentlemen,  
Ladies and Gentlemen, if you will kindly make your  
way to your seats we'll proceed with that. Thank  
you.

19:02:16

Thank you for finding your way to your  
seats. Thank you.

Thank you very much. Appreciate you  
finding your way to your seat. Thank you.

19:02:39

Thank you very much. The bar will be  
open for dinner. Thank you.

(Whereupon, remarks were made among  
those present, off the Record, after which the  
following occurred:)

1 MS. GELLICI: Thank you for making your  
2 way to your seat, please.

3 Steve, you can do this better than I am.  
4 They'll get quiet when you're up here.

19:03:38 5 Okay, thank you, everyone. If you could  
6 finally make your way to your seats, we would like  
7 to get started with our program for this morning.

8 Everyone is hungry. Thank you for  
9 making your way to your seat. We greatly  
19:03:54 10 appreciate it.

11 CALL TO ORDER AND OPENING REMARKS:

12 ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: All right.  
13 All those guys standing around the bar, sit down.

14 I'd ask everyone to sit down, please.

19:05:16 15 Okay.

16 So, this is a rowdier group than I  
17 remembered when I was at the, on the National Coal  
18 Council, and I think that's a good thing that  
19 people are rowdier. Hopefully that means you're in  
19:05:31 20 a good mood, or at least a better mood than you  
21 were a year ago or a year and a-half ago.

22 (Whereupon, applause was had.)

23 ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: So,

1 welcome to the kickoff of the 2018 spring meeting  
2 of the National Coal Council. I feel like I need  
3 to apologize on behalf of the Department of Energy  
4 for being a little tardy in getting this thing  
19:06:09 5 moving, especially to Janet and her staff.

6 You know, we're new at the government  
7 game. We're trying to figure it out, and it turns  
8 out -- This will surprise you, but it turns out  
9 that when you get into the federal government,  
19:06:25 10 there is an overabundance of bureaucracy. Who  
11 knew?

12 And, so, due to that bureaucracy, it  
13 just took us a little bit longer. I'd like to  
14 stand up here and assure you that we will be more  
19:06:46 15 expeditious next time, but it is the government, so  
16 I don't know that I can.

17 But, I will do my level best to be more  
18 expeditious, and to push all the paperwork through  
19 so that you all can do the job that we need you to  
19:07:07 20 do.

21 (Whereupon, applause was had.)

22 ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: And, on  
23 that note, I, I do want to thank you all for being

1 here tonight, and I want to thank everyone who  
2 helped organize tonight's program. Special thanks  
3 to NCC Chair Greg Workman.

4 Greg.

19:07:31

5 (Whereupon, applause was had.)

6 ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: Thank you.

7 Deck Slone?

8 MR. SLONE: Here.

9 ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: Thank you.

19:07:39

10 (Whereupon, applause was had.)

11 ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: Members of

12 the Executive Committee for their leadership, and

13 especially to Janet and to Orynthia for all the

14 hard work and putting up with us at the DOE, and

19:07:54

15 being patient with us. So, thank you very much.

16 (Whereupon, applause was had.)

17 ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: I know

18 many of you, and it was great catching up with a

19 number of you at the reception. I didn't get to

19:08:06

20 catch up with everybody, but I see a lot of

21 familiar faces here.

22 For those of you that don't know me, I'm

23 Steve Winberg. I happen to be the Assistant

1 Secretary for Fossil Energy, and I'm proud to be  
2 there.

3 (Whereupon, applause was had.)

4 ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: And, this  
19:08:26 5 applause has to stop, because food is coming,  
6 right? And, I want to get a drink.

7 Yeah, I've -- Before coming to DOE I  
8 spent 39 years in the fossil energy industry,  
9 mostly on coal, but also some on natural gas. My  
19:08:43 10 last career stop was at Battelle.

11 I was there for about three years.  
12 Prior to that I was with Consol Energy, and I ran  
13 the R&D Group of Consol Energy of both coal and  
14 natural gas.

15 And, prior to that I was with  
16 Consolidated Natural Gas, but always in emerging  
17 technology arena. And, so, I worked on not only  
18 emerging technology, but also a lot of policy  
19 issues.

19:09:10 20 I go back to the electric and gas  
21 deregulation days, so I go back a fair piece. I'm  
22 getting used to the idea of being on this side of  
23 the podium as opposed to being over with the real

1 people, and, and I can tell you that the last 19  
2 weeks or so have been a real whirlwind for me.

3 I've had the opportunity to travel with  
4 the Secretary of Energy. We went over to the  
19:09:38 5 Middle East, and here's one thing I can tell you  
6 about our Secretary:

7 Everywhere that he goes, he sells  
8 American technology and he sells American energy:  
9 Coal, natural gas, and, of course, the technology.  
19:09:55 10 And, I think -- And, I've watched him in action.

11 He does a tremendous job at it. So, I'm  
12 honored to be, to be able to work for Secretary  
13 Perry.

14 I look forward to being with you  
19:10:11 15 tomorrow. I, I think I'm going to be able to be  
16 with you all day tomorrow, and so I think we're  
17 going to have an excellent program.

18 And, I know you're probably eager to get  
19 started after all this time that we've wasted, so  
19:10:25 20 this evening is to enjoy the meal, enjoy our  
21 colleagues in the industry, get to know each other  
22 a little bit better.

23 And, I'm going to introduce Tom Pyle,

1 from the American Energy Alliance. I, I think  
2 we're going to wrap up by 9:00 o'clock this evening  
3 and we'll get down to business 8:30 tomorrow  
4 morning.

19:10:52 5 Right? Okay.

6 So, I'm sorry. Greg will introduce  
7 tonight's speaker, Tom Pyle.

8 I didn't read my notes very well. So,  
9 without further ado, let's get under weigh so we  
19:11:06 10 can hear our speaker and then enjoy our dinner and  
11 comradery and begin tomorrow morning, 8:30 sharp.

12 So, thank you, everyone.

13 (Whereupon, applause was had. Those  
14 present broke for dinner, after which the following  
19:11:18 15 occurred:)

16 MS. GALLICI: Thank you for the portion  
17 of our program. If you could finally find your way  
18 to your seat.

19 Thank you very much. I hope you enjoyed  
20:09:12 20 your dinner.

21 I'm glad everybody's been enjoying the  
22 conversation. I wanted to call to the podium our  
23 chairman, Greg Workman.

1                   And, if you will please join me, this is  
2 Greg's last meeting for us as Chair. So, if you  
3 would please join me in welcoming, and I'll do  
4 that.

20:09:34

5                   (Whereupon, applause was had.)

6                   THE CHAIR: Thank you, Janet.

7                   Certainly a bitter-sweet day for me, but  
8 I've enjoyed serving as Chair, and you'll hear you  
9 more. Maybe I might be it tomorrow.

20:09:51

10                   But, it's been a wonderful ride.

11                   Certainly an interesting, bright group.

12                   I've just been so impressed with the  
13 National Coal Council the last few years. The  
14 energy and the enthusiasm, really done some great  
15 things.

20:10:05

16                   So, keep it up. I'll be around. Not  
17 going anywhere.

18                   So, my job tonight is to introduce our  
19 very dynamic and interesting speaker, so let me get  
20 about that and let, let's hear from him. He's got  
21 some interesting points for us.

20:10:16

22                   But, so, Tom Pyle is the president of,  
23 of the Institute for Energy Research and its

1 advocacy arm, the Energy, American Energy Alliance,  
2 AEA. In this capacity Tom brings a unique  
3 background of public- and private-sector experience  
4 to, to manage IER's Washington, D.C.-based staff  
20:10:43 5 and operations.

6 He also develops the organization's  
7 free-market positions which we're interested to  
8 learn about, and implementation of efforts with  
9 stakeholders, including lawmakers, energy agency  
20:10:57 10 officials, industry leaders, consumers, and the  
11 media.

12 He recently managed the Department of  
13 Energy as part of the presidential transition team,  
14 as well. So, prior to his current position, Tom  
20:11:09 15 was President and founder of Pyle Consulting, an  
16 active public-affairs and lobbying, lobbying firm  
17 with a wide range of private-sector and  
18 not-for-profit customers.

19 He also served as vice president of  
20:11:24 20 Cassidy and Associates. So, I worked through  
21 the -- I'll skip through some of Tom's -- I did  
22 think one thing that was interesting.

23 He's a poly-sci graduate from University

1 of California. We had so interesting discussions  
2 on that.

3 But, it's very interesting that the coal  
4 sector coming out of poly-sci and California. So,  
20:11:46 5 that certainly creates for a dynamic individual.

6 And, so, without further ado, please  
7 welcome, or join me in welcoming Tom. Thanks.

8 (Whereupon, applause was had.)

9 KEYNOTE PRESENTATION:

20:12:07 10 MR. PYLE: Thank you very much, Greg,  
11 for that kind introduction.

12 And, I want to thank Janet, also. This  
13 is to Secretary Winberg, members of the National  
14 Coal Council, and all the folks at DOE for letting  
20:12:18 15 me share some time with you tonight.

16 Lastly I'd like to thank some of you in  
17 the room who have supported my organization over  
18 the years because we can't do what we do without  
19 your help. So, you know who you are, and thank you  
20:12:32 20 very much.

21 Great to be here tonight on yet another  
22 slow news day. I don't think anybody is happy to  
23 see that Paul Ryan's actually stepping down, but,

1       except maybe for Scott Pruitt.

2                   And, also, we, we do wish Speaker Ryan  
3       the very best, and are grateful for the work that  
4       he and President Trump have done with the source  
20:13:00 5       and standing in federal energy and environmental  
6       policy.

7                   We especially appreciate the leadership  
8       of President Trump's energy dream team, Secretary  
9       Perry, Secretary Zinke, and Administrator Pruitt.

20:13:14 10       So, there are many challenges that lie ahead for  
11       coal, but at least we now have an Administration  
12       that recognizes and appreciates its value to  
13       society.

14                   I'd like to talk to you tonight about  
20:13:26 15       where we are, how we got here, but more  
16       importantly, where we go from here. To set the  
17       stage, share a quote from one of my favorite books,  
18       The Rational Optimist, by Matt Ridley.

19                   Quote, the big firms that survive will  
20:13:43 20       do so by turning themselves into evolvers. The  
21       market evolves, and we need to do so as well.

22                   That much I firmly believe is the key to  
23       coal's future. For those who are unfamiliar with

1 my organization I'd like to talk briefly, just  
2 briefly about who we are.

3           Since founding the American Energy  
4 Alliance a decade ago, we've prided ourselves in  
20:14:07 5 being an effective voice of the energy policy  
6 arena. Organization's built on supporting the  
7 principles of the free market.

8           Our mission is to free energy producers  
9 and suppliers from arbitrary government  
20:14:21 10 interventions in order to allow them literally to  
11 deliver power to the people. So, when it comes to  
12 coal, we share the vision expressed by William  
13 Stanley Jenks over one hundred years ago in his  
14 seminal work The Coal Quest.

20:14:38 15           He said, quote, day by day it becomes  
16 more evident that the coal we happily possess in  
17 excellent quantity and abundance is the mainstream,  
18 mainspring of modern material civilization. It is  
19 material, material energy of the country, and  
20:14:56 20 universal aid, the factor in everything we do.

21           With coal, almost any feat is possible  
22 or easy. Without it, we are thrown back into the  
23 laborious poverty of early times.

1                   While generally he was a peak coal  
2     disciple and was right about the importance of  
3     coal, he wrongly predicted its demise. The world  
4     has hundreds of years' of coal, and America's  
20:15:25 5     supply is the most out of all of them.

6                   But, coal faces a very different  
7     challenge, Impervious to all the market forces,  
8     industrial and renewable policies, and a movement  
9     that has dedicated billions of dollars towards  
20:15:42 10    demonizing this product as the culprit for a dying  
11    plant.

12                  Where once it was the biggest fish in  
13    the energy pond, coal now finds itself struggling  
14    to find its place. Before President Obama took  
20:15:56 15    office, coal was responsible for 48 percent of  
16    electric generation in America.

17                  In 2017, it was down to 30.1 percent.  
18    And, it's projected by EIA to provide 28.5 percent  
19    of the U.S. electricity next year.

20:16:12 20                  Ten years ago we had over, we had 600  
21    coal-fired plants in the United States. Today we  
22    have fewer than 400.

23                  As of February, 2018, there were 810

1 individual coal-fired electric generating electric  
2 power plants, representing a total of approximately  
3 260,000 megawatts of electric generating capacity.  
4 For, for perspective, there were 317 megawatts of  
20:16:42 5 coal-fired electric, electric generating capacity  
6 in 2010.

7 Some of coal's competitors, namely  
8 renewables, have emerged due to a combination of  
9 government handouts, and a slew of Regulations  
20:16:57 10 designed to kneecap the fossil-fuel industry. We  
11 call it the Tanya Harding approach to energy  
12 policy.

13 But, the dominant market competitor for  
14 coal share in electricity is natural gas. In  
20:17:14 15 addition to sitting atop the world's best coal  
16 resources, the U.S. is awash in natural gas.

17 The Shell revolution has fundamentally  
18 transformed the domestic energy outlook, and the  
19 world along with it. A decade ago no one would  
20:17:31 20 have predicted the natural, the natural-gas boom.

21 Our own EIA completely whipped this one.  
22 In 2009's Annual Energy Outlook, EIA wrote, quote:

23 Coal continues to provide the largest

1 share of energy for U.S. electric generation in a  
2 reference case, with only a modest increase, from  
3 49 percent in 2027, to 47 + in 2030.

4 In 2005, the U.S. produced about 19  
20:18:04 5 trillion cubic feet of gas. In the course of the  
6 next ten years that figure climbed to almost 29  
7 trillion cubic feet, an increase of over 50  
8 percent.

9 Naturally, the price plummeted in that  
20:18:19 10 same timeframe. In June of 2008, the inflation  
11 adjustment price of gas per million BTUs was over  
12 \$15. By the spring of 2012, the price was just a  
13 tick above \$2.00.

14 And for the last three and a-half years  
20:18:36 15 it's been below \$4.00 consistently. But,  
16 advantages remain for coal over natural gas.

17 Coal is less vulnerable to disruption  
18 than gas, and, as a result, rate payers can be  
19 insulated from price shocks, and coal a, is a  
20:18:55 20 healthy part of the fuel mix.

21 One addition, additional feature that is  
22 often overlooked is that a substantial portion of  
23 natural gas for electricity generation are

1 essentially inter-, interruptible. This was a  
2 natural accommodation to the logistical challenge  
3 of having one pipeline feeding a particular area or  
4 facility.

20:19:19

5 Customer in a given area who needs  
6 guaranteed supply would pay to have a first claim  
7 to avoid shortages, with other customers on  
8 interruptible contracts getting what, if any, is  
9 left. According to the EIA, in 2016, about 16  
10 percent of all natural gas nationally was provided  
11 by interruptible contracts.

20:19:36

12 But, this masks wide regional  
13 variability. In the Northeast, interruptible  
14 contracts account for fully 45 percent of, of  
15 natural, natural-gas supplies and power plants.

20:19:50

16 When you're dealing with a generating  
17 system and a heating system drawing from the same  
18 straw, interruptibility becomes a very real  
19 possibility. The cold temperatures this past  
20 winter in the Northeast saw this phenomena in  
21 action.

20:20:06

22 During winter, the home heating system  
23 takes priority, and home heating demands soared.

1 Generators were will left scrambling for  
2 natural-gas supplies, with spot prices spiking,  
3 with LNG having to import, having to be imported  
4 from Russia to try and meet demand.

20:20:32

5 Few people understand or discuss this,  
6 but as natural-gas use for electricity generation  
7 grows, it will become a significant issue. So,  
8 what's happening in New England is a case study for  
9 what looms ahead if you completely turn away from  
10 coal.

20:20:47

11 I saw New England's recent Operational  
12 Fuel Security Analysis shows that coming years  
13 could be disastrous for New Englanders. The  
14 politically compelled shift to wind and solar  
15 energy driving reliable coal and electricity  
16 generation into premature retirement, and the  
17 resulting insufficiency of secure fuel arrangements  
18 will lead to rolling blackouts in the future.

20:20:59

20:21:14

19 And, contrary to the expectations of the  
20 wind and solar bowls, the closures of coal plants  
21 like Braden Point often pave the way for natural  
22 gas, not renewables. Again from the report, quote:

23 More renewable resources can help lesson

1 the fuel's fuel security risks, but are likely to  
2 drive coal- and oil-fired generation retirements  
3 requiring high LNG imports to counteract the loss  
4 of storage requirements.

20:21:44

5 In 2000, natural gas represented 18  
6 percent of New England's electricity fuel mix. By  
7 2017, that figure had climbed to 45 percent, and by  
8 2025, ISO New England forecast natural gas was 50  
9 percent, six percent, 56 percent of New England's  
10 electricity.

20:22:04

11 In that same timeframe, coal has dropped  
12 from 12 percent of the mix, to three percent, and  
13 will be nonexistent by 2025. This is not New  
14 England dependent on a fuel source that cannot be  
15 stored on site and deployed during times of peak  
16 demand as we saw this past January.

20:22:23

17 On the government side, coal is  
18 experiencing unprecedented left-right hook of  
19 generous handouts to renewables, and a host of  
20 crushing Regulations like the MATS rule  
21 specifically designed to drive the utility industry  
22 away from the use of coal.

20:22:37

23 Electricity markets today are burdened

1 by a tangle of government intervention and  
2 regulatory tape which gives credence to Secretary  
3 Perry's statement that there is no free market in  
4 the energy industry.

20:23:01

5 For decades the renewable industries has  
6 been the beneficiary of distortionary policies like  
7 the production tax credit, renewable portfolio  
8 mandates, and purpose, and the list goes on and on  
9 and on. This has made electricity more expensive  
10 for the public, and has made resilience a live  
11 issue for the industry.

20:23:16

12 The wind PTC is the mother of all  
13 renewable subsidies. It has been extended and  
14 adjusted multiple times since 1992, costing  
15 taxpayers an estimated more than \$17 billion to  
16 date, and projected to cost another 37 and a-half  
17 billion dollars over a ten-year window to 2026.

20:23:33

18 If those numbers aren't enough, you can  
19 add another 13 billion in subsidies from the Obama  
20 stimulus, which mostly went to wind projects, as  
21 well as a projected more than 24 billion over the  
22 next ten years going into the investment tax credit  
23 received mostly by solar companies.

20:23:55

1                   Currently 29 States and the District of  
2 Columbia have renewable portfolio mandates, with  
3 another eight States setting a voluntary goal for  
4 renewable energy. An assessment of the  
20:24:20 5 Massachusetts RPS prepared by, prepared by the  
6 Northeast Clean Energy Council, described the  
7 dynamic between renewable mandate and reliable coal  
8 power in stark terms.

9                   Quote: As more renewables come on line,  
20:24:36 10 they act as must-take resources, causing generation  
11 from conventional sources, resources like natural  
12 gas and coal, to reduce or be displaced. Even in a  
13 base case, the anticipated growth of renewables  
14 results in the retirement of all but one New  
20:24:56 15 England coal unit during the study period.

16                   Of course, that's precisely the purpose  
17 of the RPS. On their own, these and a myriad of  
18 other giveaways with the renewable industry would  
19 likely not have severely impacted coal.

20:25:14 20                   In fact, the most pernicious aspects of  
21 these policies is the effect to the taxpayer. To  
22 quote Matt Ridley once again, to get a toehold in  
23 the electric market at all, wind power requires the

1 aggressive transfer from ordinary working people to  
2 rent from rich landowners. As a rule of thumb, a  
3 wind turbine generates more value in subsidy than  
4 it does in electricity.

20:25:44

5 Warren Buffet, a major wind producer,  
6 also understands this phenomenon. In 2014, he  
7 said:

8 We get a tax credit if we build a lot of  
9 wind farms. That's the only reason to build them.

20:25:57

10 They don't make sense without the tax credit.

11 But, when you combine this with the  
12 right hook of the regulatory burdens placed  
13 squarely on coal, the Government has had a  
14 devastating impact on this industry. I don't mean  
15 to recite all the burdens right here as we pain,  
16 painfully went through them together, especially  
17 during the Obama years.

20:26:13

18 And, imagine where we would be if we  
19 were a year and three months into the Hillary  
20 Clinton Administration.

20:26:30

21 (Whereupon, a general response was had.)

22 MR. PYLE: My organization is helping on  
23 this front. And, while much work needs to be done,

1 it's important to remember that President Trump has  
2 already delivered some big wins for coal.

3 Three big improvements that weren't  
4 headliners but mean a lot to the people in this  
20:26:50 5 room were the lifting of the federal coal leasing  
6 ban, the stream protection rule CRA, and the  
7 reassessment of the so-, the so-called social cost  
8 of carbon.

9 According to a study we published in  
20:27:04 10 2016, the long-term benefits of keeping the coal  
11 from federal lands in the Powder River Basin to  
12 coal leasing would generate nearly 90 billion in  
13 the U.S. economy, producing over 260,000 jobs each  
14 year, with over 16 billion in additional annual  
20:27:25 15 wages.

16 We can give thanks that Congress and  
17 President Trump axed the Interior Department's  
18 Stream Protection Rule. The Department estimated,  
19 estimate that SPR would have led to additional  
20:27:40 20 annual compliance costs of 52 million, and would  
21 have put hundreds of thousands of jobs at risk.

22 The Regulation would have had the  
23 largest impact on the people of West Virginia,

1 Ohio, Kentucky, and Pennsylvania, States that were  
2 already, have already endured years of costing  
3 Regulations due to Obama's war on coal.

4 President Trump also immediately  
20:28:05 5 adjusted the social, the social cost of carbon to  
6 less than \$6 in the year 2020, versus the Obama  
7 Administration 2020 estimate of \$45. At nearly  
8 every agency the Trump Administration is working to  
9 make energy production simpler and easier across  
20:28:24 10 the board, without sacrificing legitimate  
11 environment protections.

12 Nowhere is this more evident than at the  
13 EPA, where 22 regulatory actions have already been  
14 finalized, saving the economy an estimated billion  
20:28:42 15 dollars in regulatory costs. They have ended the  
16 practice of sue and settle, and planned to end use  
17 of secret science in rulemaking.

18 And, of course, the most significant  
19 Regulation for all of the coal industry, the  
20:28:56 20 so-called Clean Power Plan, is well on its way out  
21 of being, replaced or reissued, repealed, I should  
22 say, or reissued in a manner consistent with the  
23 Clean Air Act and proper relations between EPA and

1 the States.

2 The CPP, which we called "Creating  
3 Poverty Plan," was never about clean power. The  
4 Nation's electricity generation fleet was already  
5 very clean and getting cleaner, as shown by the  
6 nearly 70-percent reductions in criteria since  
7 1970.

8 The Plan was really about instituting  
9 more federal control over a dispersed system and  
10 driving up the cost of reliable electricity, in  
11 line with the previous Administration's climate  
12 ideology.

13 The result would have been residents in  
14 more than 40 States experiencing  
15 double-digit-percentage increases in their  
16 electricity rates by 2030. Beyond its implications  
17 in terms of dollars and cents, the Plan wasn't  
18 competitive federally, as the EPA claimed, but  
19 coercive federal intervention and a misapplication  
20 of the Clean Air Act.

21 It extended EPA's power in unprecedented  
22 ways, and marked a clear deviation from the  
23 Agency's traditional role.

1 I know that there's some disagreement in  
2 this room about the path forward with a power plan,  
3 but our aim is to create a play to scrap it  
4 altogether. I've joked earlier about Administrator  
20:30:29 5 Pruitt's headlines, but because of the important  
6 work he is doing to reform EPA, we've gone to the  
7 mat to support him, and have joined forces with  
8 dozens of conservatives to encourage President  
9 Trump to, hashtag, stand with Scott.

20:30:47 10 Looking ahead, we need to capitalize on  
11 this unique program to make strides towards a more  
12 efficient, effective system by rolling back the  
13 government mandates and other Policies that have  
14 gotten us into this mess in the first place.

20:31:00 15 But, it will take years to secure our  
16 energy freedom through the legislative process. In  
17 the meantime, my thoughts are what the coal  
18 industry can focus on in the confines of this  
19 political entitlement environment in what I call  
20:31:14 20 the three Es, efficiency, emerging tech, and  
21 exports.

22 Now, I'm not going to stand up here and  
23 act like I'm the smartest guy in the room. I know

1 you're thinking about these things, and that you're  
2 the ones who have to grapple with all these  
3 challenges.

20:31:33 4 But, from my vantage point, these are  
5 promising opportunities. Number one, we have to  
6 find a way to make coal plants more efficient.

7 There's a mismatch between the size of  
8 coal plants and the requirements of many systems.  
9 For the time being, large central-station power  
20:31:49 10 plants are probably a thing of the past.

11 System operators are going to prefer to  
12 have less lumpy, more nimble features. We need  
13 less lumpy, more -- less lumpy, -- Sorry. -- and more  
14 nimble power plants.

20:32:06 15 And, let's face it. Unless the  
16 economics improve dramatically, it's highly  
17 unlikely we'll build any new power plants.

18 The Trump Administration has begun to  
19 approve the new sources of energy plants, which  
20:32:14 20 currently kills the ability for coal-fired,  
21 coal-powered generation to innovate and upgrade by  
22 requiring deadlines for Permit decisions.

23 They can go further still. The most

1 modern and efficient technology, technologies and  
2 environmental controls for coal-fired power plants  
3 that we see being deployed in Asia are not used in  
4 the U.S. because of this cost.

20:32:39

5 While some of that is the cost of the  
6 upgrades themselves, it is also the length and  
7 arbitrariness of the NSR process make it not even  
8 worth trying.

20:32:52

9 Number two, along with being nimble has  
10 to come the ability to adapt and evolve. Maybe the  
11 time has come to think radically about what this  
12 resource can be used for.

20:33:07

13 If natural-gas prices stay low, can we  
14 find nontraditional uses for coal? Newly emergent  
15 ideas like carbon fiber, as Oak Ridge National  
16 Laboratory used to build a submersible for the U.S.  
17 Navy with a treating center.

20:33:23

18 If carbon fibers do fine as coal  
19 biproducts, what about using coal and coal  
20 biproducts to recover rare-earth elements? Once  
21 again, we've virtual-, we've got a virtually  
22 unlimited supply beneath our feet, but we need to  
23 find a way to make it profitable.

1                   Number three, we need a rampable market.  
2   Coal is going to shrink as a percentage of our  
3   market here at home, but that isn't the case across  
4   the Pacific.

20:33:41   5                   In 2018, it's expected that we'll export  
6   100 million tons, or 13 percent of production.  
7   That's up from eight percent in 2016.

8                   Where are these markets? India, which  
9   desperately needs generation capacity; China, the  
20:34:00   10   world's biggest consumer; in Japan, using coal to  
11   make up for its lost nuclear capacity.

12                  The International Energy Agency expects  
13   coal and coal-fired capacity do increase by 50  
14   percent over today's platform by 2040. Exports are  
20:34:16   15   a great opportunity to utilize this tremendous  
16   natural resource we have in the economic and  
17   political environment worldwide.

18                  Gas is cheap here, but foreign  
19   companies, primarily in Asia, can import our coal  
20:34:31   20   for less than they can import natural gas, at least  
21   for now. One promising example is Cloud Peak's  
22   deal with Fukushima Prefecture, which will account  
23   for almost a-quarter of all Cloud Peak's exports.

1           Of course, the white whale in the export  
2 market is China. Coal is supplying 62 percent of  
3 China's total energy needs, according to 2016 data  
4 and VP's statistical review of world energy.

20:35:01

5           China, however, is focusing on  
6 supercritical and ultrasupercritical power plants.  
7 Not only is China building efficient coal plants in  
8 its own country, but Chinese companies are helping  
9 to build and finance hundreds of coal-fired power  
20:35:16 10 plants around the world, many of which are in  
11 Africa.

12           Of China's 100 top plants, 90 are  
13 ultrasupercritical, while the United States has  
14 just one ultrasupercritical plant. Of the 920  
20:35:29 15 gigawatts of coal capacity in China, 19 percent is  
16 ultrasupercritical, 25 percent is supercritical,  
17 and 56 percent is subcritical.

18           Ultimately, China plans to increase its  
19 coal-fired plants to almost 1,100 gigawatts, which  
20:35:47 20 is over three times the coal-fired capacity of the  
21 United States.

22           The market might not be here in America  
23 today, but there is a market for what you're

1 producing, nevertheless. We just need to find a  
2 way to get it there.

3 On the political side of things, our  
4 eyes are on the Washington State Pollution Control  
20:36:07 5 Hearings Board Hearing for the Millennium  
6 Application to export coal from Long View,  
7 Washington. This is the exact sort of project that  
8 pro-energy, pro-coal, pro-prosperity crowds need to  
9 throw its weight behind.

20:36:24 10 The Millennium Project will bring with  
11 it nearly 3,000 jobs and 780 million for  
12 construction, plus 16 million in ongoing wages.  
13 For a county with ten, ten percent unemployment,  
14 that's huge.

20:36:38 15 There is no sugar-coating this. Coal is  
16 in a disadvantaged position due to the emergence of  
17 domestic natural gas. But, just as we couldn't  
18 predict the Shell revolution, other market forces  
19 could just as easily change that equation.

20:36:55 20 We know that LNG exports are only going  
21 to increase, which will eventually exert upward  
22 pressure on domestic gas price. Perhaps that way  
23 coal can reestablish itself in the mix, alongside

1 our growing exports.

2 The bottom line is that we are sitting  
3 on top of nearly 500 billion short tons of  
4 recoverable resource, and we've got to find a way  
5 to make it profitable. We can work together to  
6 remove the government interventions that have held  
7 us back.

8 When it was announced that I was  
9 appointed to the Trump Transition Team, one of you  
10 in this room warned me against assuming that the  
11 election had changed anything about the broader  
12 policy in energy landscape. He was right.

13 Unless we confront the all-out assaults  
14 from the environmental left in your industry, you  
15 will continue to lose ground. You may I see it  
16 differently, but it's my stance that the time for  
17 cooperation and placating the environmental left is  
18 over.

19 The idea that the environmentalists care  
20 at all about the future of coal or coal miners is  
21 obviously false. But, it's time to make the case  
22 that by attacking coal, they're really attacking  
23 this country's ability to power itself with

1 resilience and reliability.

2 My organization, the National Energy  
3 Alliance, has never been afraid to take the slings  
4 and arrows. But, you must also stand up.

20:38:24

5 The "enviros" have put a lot of us on  
6 our heels, and some energy players have begun to  
7 kowtow to the dogma of the climate issue. This is  
8 not only in strategy.

20:38:38

9 Some of the most significant and  
10 successful oil and gas companies have now, for  
11 example, endorsed the idea of a carbon tax. Has  
12 this got the "enviros" off their backs?

20:38:53

13 Of course not. Instead, they're getting  
14 sued for, for providing America the transportation  
15 fuel that drives our economy.

16 This should be a lesson to the coal  
17 industry. No concessions to the environmental  
18 lobby are in your best interest.

20:39:08

19 They are dead set not on limiting your  
20 business, but destroying it. It's time to go on  
21 the offensive to let the public know that coal is  
22 fundamentally the tool to improve people's lives.

23 If, if the deep decarbonization movement

1 is successful, they will only succeed in siphoning  
2 resources away from the real demands of life:  
3 transportation, healthcare, education; in other  
4 words, the things that bring people happiness.

20:39:36

5 The case where affordable energy rests  
6 on those grounds, these resources and our ability  
7 to bring them to people across the globe matter for  
8 the things that we care about the most. The  
9 situation you face as an industry is no easy one.

20:39:56

10 We can help by clearing the policy mine  
11 fields. But, you need to defend the immense value  
12 coal provides to all Americans, and get more  
13 creative in how you bring this resource into the  
14 marketplace.

20:40:09

15 I'll close with this, again from Matt  
16 Ridley: You can regret the sinful, the sinful  
17 profligacy, prof-, profligacy, profligacy of the  
18 modern world, which is the conventional reaction.

20:40:28

19 Or, you can conclude that were it not for fossil  
20 fuels, 99 percent of people would have to live in  
21 slavery, while the rest have a decent standard of,  
22 standard of living.

23 And, that's why we'll always be needing

1 coal. Thank you.

2 (Whereupon, applause was had.)

3 MR. PYLE: I guess I'm supposed to take  
4 questions.

20:40:57 5 MS. GALLICI: Thank you, Tom.

6 Tom has graciously agreed to, to take a  
7 few questions.

8 And, thank you, Tom, so much for your  
9 remarks tonight.

20:41:00 10 MR. PYLE: Sure.

11 MS. GALLICI: You've given us lots of  
12 stuff for us to think about going forward into our  
13 meeting tomorrow.

14 Does anybody have a question for Tom?

20:41:08 15 (Whereupon, no response was had.)

16 MS. GALLICI: So, so, I'll start with  
17 one while you're thinking of it.

18 You mentioned about new, new uses for  
19 coal and I'm very interesting what your group is  
20 doing. We have a lot of people in this room that  
21 are very interested in new markets for coal, and  
22 I'm curious to know about what your thoughts are,  
23 and to how we can promote that and advance that,

1 and what your group might be doing for it.

2 MR. PYLE: Well, as I mentioned, we've  
3 got, we've got to build, you know, the ability to  
4 export the resource. We've got to fight these  
5 battles.

20:41:45

6 Washington State I think --

7 MS. GALLICI: I'm sorry. By "new  
8 markets for coal," I'm talking about noncombustible  
9 non-power-generation markets. Sorry.

20:41:58

10 MR. PYLE: Oh, sorry.

11 MS. GALLICI: Sorry. Yes.

12 MR. PYLE: Well, I mean, really, you  
13 guys are the ones that can, can do that. I mean,  
14 you've got the expertise and the ability working  
15 with DOE and the, and the, and the Labs to find,  
16 find ways to, to eke out more value for the  
17 resource.

20:42:05

18 Our job, as I mentioned, is to fight the  
19 government side; to, to push back against the  
20 marketing hazards that really have, have  
21 contributed immensely to the reductions in, in our  
22 ability to, to use the resource in a more  
23 traditional way.

20:42:20

1           So, I leave it to the smart guys in  
2 order to figure those things out.

3           MS. GALLICI: We have a lot of them in  
4 the room.

20:42:39 5           I'll get back to you if you. Kindly  
6 state your name and your affiliation.

7           We're on the Record today, so give that  
8 for the Record.

9           MR. ROLING: Dan Roling, with Carbon  
20:42:47 10 Recovery Systems.

11           You made a comment earlier about, to  
12 paraphrase, unfair subsidies and tax credits of  
13 renewable energy versus traditional fossil fuels.  
14 I've been on both sides of the equation, and you're  
20:43:04 15 absolutely right.

16           But, what's the possibility, even in a  
17 strong Administration like the Trump  
18 Administration, to undo the unfair tax subsidies  
19 given to renewables?

20:43:14 20           MR. PYLE: Well, clearly we have some  
21 challenges in the Republican Party on that issue,  
22 as well, and it has been a struggle. But, I will  
23 say this:

1                   When we started to educate and raise  
2 awareness about the wind production tax credit, for  
3 example, it was a noncontroversial extender. It  
4 hit the floor voice vote.

20:43:42

5                   It passed every year. There were no  
6 challenges on the other side of the aisle.

20:43:52

7                   But, by educating folks, and driving the  
8 impacts of what the subsidies were on increased  
9 cost, on the taxpayer, on the, on the negative, the  
10 negative pricing and influence in the markets, et  
11 cetera, we were able to create controversy where  
12 there once was none.

20:44:05

13                   And, so, you know, you can't just throw  
14 your hands up and say, "We're never going to get  
15 this done," all right? You know, we have to keep  
16 pushing, keep pushing.

20:44:14

17                   And, you know, we have to fill that  
18 void, or the other side's going to fill it. So, I,  
19 I say it's hard.

20                   It's a challenge. We have -- One of our  
21 biggest challenges is that a lot of this is being  
22 done by a pen and phone. As Obama, President Obama  
23 famously stated, you know: If I can't get my will

1 through Congress, I can do it on the regulatory  
2 side."

20:44:40

3 And, the challenge there for this  
4 industry is, just as the previous Administration  
5 did to you what they did, this Administration  
6 undoing that, the next Administration can go and do  
7 it again. And, until we get these changes cemented  
8 in law and legislation, we're never going to get  
9 there.

20:44:53

10 And, so, we have to work in the interim  
11 to create markets for the resource that, for, you  
12 know, to kind of go through that process, while, at  
13 the same time, we're working to make these, these  
14 things permanent.

20:45:04

15 So, for example, there's an effort to  
16 include some of the regulatory reforms that are  
17 critical into must-pass legislation that requires  
18 just a simple majority in the Senate. So, we've  
19 got the keep hacking away at it, and we've got to  
20 really create a political environment where the,  
21 the members of Congress, themselves, see the  
22 advantage of addressing these issues.

20:45:20

23 Right now they just see the downside.

1 So, we've got to push, push, push on that, on that  
2 approach.

3 MS. GALLICI: Right here.

4 MR. PYLE: Yes.

5 MR. DESCHENE: I'm going to stand  
6 because I'm way over here on the side here. First  
7 of all, let me introduce myself.

20:45:48

8 I'm C.J. Deschene. I'm Program Director  
9 with the National Tribal Energy Association. I  
10 want to agree with you.

11 I had a question there. You made a  
12 statement there on the, on the Millennium bulk  
13 terminal.

20:46:00

14 And, it's very important that we look  
15 at, you know, areas of exporting. I know we all,  
16 we're all aware of some of the fight that's, that's  
17 there. I'm glad you brought that up.

20:46:16

18 One of the things I was looking at was  
19 you stated that that's something that we needed to  
20 stand behind, and I agree with you. Now, how do we  
21 go about doing that?

22 I mean, is your, is your, your, your  
23 alliance, I guess, would you be willing to back

1 that up with a, --

2 MR. PYLE: Yes.

3 MR. DESCHENE: -- an Amicus Brief or  
4 something?

20:46:37 5 MR. PYLE: Yes. Yes, we do, we do, we  
6 do all the regulatory work.

7 We do Amicus Briefs.

8 MR. DESCHENE: That, that would be  
9 great.

20:46:43 10 MR. PYLE: We're down on the ground  
11 talking to folks in the area through social media  
12 platforms and everything else. I mean, the bottom  
13 line is that we have to work every, every angle of  
14 the process for policymakers, staff,  
20:46:57 15 Administration.

16 We have to work the media. And, more  
17 important, we have to get out and talk to folks,  
18 because at the end of the day they're the ones who  
19 are going to push for the agendas that need to take  
20:47:07 20 place.

21 MR. DESCHENE: I'm glad. I'm glad you  
22 stated that, because regardless, if it's going to  
23 benefit any ONE of the people here or, or more

1 through the Millennium bulk terminal, still there's  
2 other terminals out there that are going to be  
3 created or that's already in existence that's going  
4 to be affecting some of the people here.

20:47:26

5 And, I believe that they should all be  
6 supporting these other areas, whether it doesn't  
7 support them indirectly or directly, that they  
8 should be supporting them. And, I believe through  
9 this Council, that if the group effort of, of  
10 support, whether it's through amicus or whatever,  
11 because they're in court right now.

20:47:40

12 And, I believe that's something that we,  
13 we really stand behind. So, I appreciate that, and  
14 I just wanted to make that clear.

20:47:51

15 That's why I'm going to make that  
16 statement. So, I'm going to give this back to  
17 Janet and given somebody else a chance.

18 Thank you.

19 MS. GALLICI: That you. Thank you, CJ.

20:48:00

20 And, I will mention a little bit more  
21 tomorrow. Secretary Perry has asked the National  
22 Coal Council to make a report on assessing U.S.  
23 coal export opportunities and challenges. So,

1 we'll be undertaking that report over the next few  
2 months.

3 And, our NCC members have been made  
4 aware of that. So, which maybe you'll see CJ.

20:48:22

5 But, other questions for Tom? We'll  
6 take one or two more, and....

20:48:37

7 MR. COLLINS: Tom Collins, Western  
8 Research Institute of Wyoming. I'd like your  
9 thoughts on potential to repeal the engagement  
10 finding for CO2. In 2016 we had a white paper  
11 saying CO2 actually helped prevent the problem of  
12 feeding the world because 180 parts per million of  
13 CO2 in the atmosphere prevented the vegetation plant  
14 growth.

20:49:00

15 And, so, actually, the environmentalists  
16 have advocated that CO2 actually was beneficial.  
17 So, what's your thoughts on that?

18 MR. PYLE: Yeah. We are a strong  
19 advocate for addressing the finding.

20:49:12

20 And, we've been in, shall we say,  
21 imploring Administrator Pruitt to, to take that  
22 challenge. He's got a lot on his plate, as you can  
23 imagine, but I have not heard lack of desire to do

1 that, per se, but more of a -- You know, it's going  
2 to take a, a little bit more work to unwind some of  
3 the Union issues.

20:49:42

4 And, then, hopefully we'll see some  
5 movement there. And, I'm not speaking on behalf  
6 of, of them, or anything like that.

20:49:53

7 But, you know, this is the, the  
8 central -- This is the key. I mean, this has been  
9 the driver of all of these Policies, and will  
10 continue to be pointed back as the reason for these  
11 sort of extralegal interpretations of the Clean Air  
12 Act.

20:50:09

13 You know, it goes -- I go back to it,  
14 too. Ultimately Congress has punted on this issue.  
15 They refuse to, to deal with it. And,  
16 so, yes we hope that the Administration will take  
17 it on.

20:50:22

18 But, ultimately, until Congress weighs  
19 in and, and makes a determination about it, you  
20 know, we're, we're going to be doing this on all  
21 these Rules. In fact, the Courts have pushed back  
22 on a lot of the reforms that are taking place now  
23 because we're, we're, they're not, they're being

1 viewed as not having adequately determined the  
2 impacts based on the agent they're fighting.

3 So, you can bet we're going to put all  
4 of our resources and the time into attacking that.  
20:50:51 5 And, when and where is still, is still a question  
6 mark. So, --.

7 MS. BANAGA: Shannon Banaga, with TECO  
8 Energy. So, given the Administration's recent  
9 tariff action on solar companies and how, as well  
20:51:15 10 as steel and aluminum tariffs, is there an  
11 opportunity that the foreign community needs to see  
12 the pond here, and what would you recommend us to  
13 do?

14 MR. PYLE: Well, I, I'm remiss to  
20:51:29 15 recommend seizing on opportunities for tariffs.  
16 The tariff, you know, it kind of goes against what  
17 we believe in, but they made a, a pretty compelling  
18 case for the solar tariffs.

19 And, you know, maybe Trump is right.  
20:51:46 20 Maybe trade agreements should be thousands and  
21 thousands of pages.

22 And, so, maybe he is on to something  
23 with respect to taking these on on an individual

1 basis. So, we're probably not the right group to,  
2 to provide strategery (sic) about that.

3 But, you know, we don't agree with  
4 everything that the Administration has done. We're  
20:52:08 5 all about tearing down layers and webs of, of  
6 government intervention.

7 We're, we're unabashedly free-marketers,  
8 so to speak. So, -- But, we do understand the  
9 justification for some of it.

20:52:25 10 So, for example, we did part ways with  
11 DOE on a NOPR, for example. But, we still did  
12 recognize that they were, they were right about the  
13 problem.

14 And, so, on the tariff side there's  
20:52:39 15 probably an opportunity, but we're probably not the  
16 right ones to, to lead it on that. So, --.

17 MS. GALLICI: And, I'll ask the final  
18 question before we get Steve back up. So, are you  
19 looking at the midterm election?

20:52:53 20 And, any thoughts? Do you want to be  
21 first on the Record?

22 MR. PYLE: Look, I'm just going to be  
23 candid. That's who I am.

1 I am a creature of the House. I spent  
2 ten years in the House of Representatives.

3 I've worked in leadership, so I kind of  
4 have a sense of how things go. But, I'm  
20:53:12 5 disappointed in Congress, Republican or Democrat  
6 these days.

7 I feel like the budget process has, has  
8 totally been destroyed. We lead with a massive  
9 trillion-dollar-a-year spending Bills, and six or  
20:53:32 10 eight people getting in a room and carving up the  
11 Universe.

12 So, honestly, you know, what happens in  
13 November might not change all that significantly  
14 whatever the outcome is. If the Democrats win the  
20:53:44 15 House, you can bet there will be a ramp-up of  
16 investigations and oversight.

17 And, there's that little impeachment  
18 crowd there that the leadership will have to  
19 contend with. The Senate I think is, is harder for  
20:53:59 20 the Democratic Party to, to take control, just  
21 based on the numbers.

22 But, you know, that's possible. So, to  
23 me, it's, it's obviously more important to have a

1 party that believes in your industry and in the  
2 majority, in the majority. And, that's, you know,  
3 the highest priority.

20:54:24 4 But, at the end of the day, Congress is  
5 just not really doing all that much, good or bad,  
6 these days. Bad, but not necessarily good.

7 So, I don't know how big an impact it  
8 is.

20:54:41 9 MS. GALLICI: We'll ask you back and you  
10 can give us a debrief afterwards. Thank you.

11 MR. PYLE: Thank you. Appreciate it.

12 (Whereupon, applause was had.)

13 ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: Well,  
14 thank you for your remarks. Compelling.

20:54:59 15 Covered the waterfront on the, on the  
16 challenges facing the coal industry, but I would  
17 suggest to you perhaps the fossil energy industry  
18 on a wider basis.

20:55:17 19 You mentioned the recent monocyclone, so  
20 I can't help but do a little commercial for DOE,  
21 and more particularly, NETL. I would suggest for  
22 those of you who haven't seen the study on the  
23 monocyclone, it's compelling reading.

1                   We feel Peter Balash, I think he's still  
2     in the room. He was one of the authors of it.

3                   Right there.

4                   (Whereupon, applause was had.)

20:55:41 5                   ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: If you  
6     have questions, he can.

7                   Tom, you also talked about technology  
8     being the answer, and we in the Fossil Energy  
9     Office couldn't agree with you more. We are  
20:55:52 10    looking at the variety of technology options, and  
11    Angelos Kokkinos, --

12                  Angelos, where are you? Right here.  
13    Stand up, please.

14                  He's there.

20:56:06 15                  (Whereupon, applause was had.)

16                  ASSISTANT SECRETARY WINBERG: Any  
17    questions you have on coal technology, that's the  
18    man to ask. Don't ask me; ask him.

19                  So, we're doing a lot in that space, and  
20:56:18 20    we'll be talking about that as we, as we move  
21    forward. So, -- But, before we wrap up, I, I need  
22    to go over a little bit of business for tomorrow.

23                  We will reconvene tomorrow morning in

1 this, in this room? Okay.

2 And, during the meeting tomorrow we'll  
3 start off with elections of the new Chair and  
4 Vice-Chair. I'll deliver some remarks, and then  
20:56:45 5 we'll hear several presentations, and we will  
6 adjourn on or about noon.

7 So, we have a very packed agenda. I  
8 think it promises to be a very productive meeting.  
9 And, I sense a lot of renewed energy in this room  
20:57:03 10 and, I'm just tickled about that.

11 So, I just want to wish you all well for  
12 this evening. Thank you for coming.

13 I hope you all have a good evening, or  
14 what remains of it, and we will see you back here  
20:57:17 15 tomorrow morning at 8:30. Thank you very much.

16 (Whereupon, the above meeting was  
17 adjourned.)

18 I certify the foregoing to be a  
19 true transcript from my notes.

20 E-signature: D. I. Bunn

21 CSR CP RPR

22

23

CERTIFICATION

